

# Variations on a result of Erdős and Surányi

Dorin Andrica and Eugen J. Ionaşcu

Babeş-Bolyai University, Romania, and Columbus State University, USA

**INTEGERS 2013**: The Erdős Centennial Conference in  
Combinatorial Number Theory

University of West Georgia, Carrollton, GA, October 24-27, 2013

- 1 Erdős-Surányi sequences
- 2 Some general results
- 3 The signum equation
- 4 The  $n$ -range of an Erdős-Surányi sequence
- 5 The exceptional set of an Erdős-Surányi sequence

# 1 Erdős-Surányi sequences

In this section we present a special class of sequences of distinct positive integers, which give special representations of the integers. We say that a sequence of distinct positive integers  $\{a_m\}_{m \geq 1}$  is a *Erdős-Surányi sequence* if every integer may be written in the form

$$\pm a_1 \pm a_2 \pm \cdots \pm a_n$$

for some choices of signs  $+$  and  $-$ , in infinitely many ways. As a general example of Erdős-Surányi sequences we mention, for every  $k \in \mathbb{N}$ ,  $a_n = n^k$  (see J.Mitek, '79,[16]). For instance, for  $k = 1$  we have the representation

$$m = (-1 + 2) + (-3 + 4) + \cdots + (-(2m - 1) + 2m) + \cdots + \underbrace{[(n + 1) - (n + 2) - (n + 3) + (n + 4)]}_{=0}$$

For  $k = 2$ , we have the original result of Erdős and Surányi mentioned as a problem in the book [12] and as Problem 250 in the book of W.Sierpnski [18]. A standard proof is based on the identity  $4 = (m + 1)^2 - (m + 2)^2 - (m + 3)^2 + (m + 4)^2$  and on the basis cases

$$\begin{aligned}0 &= 1^2 + 2^2 - 3^2 + 4^2 - 5^2 - 6^2 + 7^2, \quad 1 = 1^2 \\2 &= -1^2 - 2^2 - 3^2 + 4^2, \quad 3 = -1^2 + 2^2.\end{aligned}$$

For  $k = 3$ , one may use the identity

$$\begin{aligned}- (m + 1)^3 + (m + 2)^3 + (m + 3)^3 - (m + 4)^3 \\+ (m + 5)^3 - (m + 6)^3 - (m + 7)^3 + (m + 8)^3 = 48\end{aligned}$$

and induction with a basis step for the first 48 positive integers.

An interesting example of Erdős-Surányi sequence is given by the squares of the odd integers. The proof by step 16 induction is based on the identity

$16 = (2m + 5)^2 - (2m + 3)^2 - (2m + 1)^2 + (2m - 1)^2$ , and on the basis cases

$$0 = -1^2 + 3^2 + 5^2 - 7^2 + 9^2 - 11^2 - 13^2 + 15^2$$

$$1 = 1^2$$

$$2 = 1^2 + 3^2 + 5^2 - 7^2 + 9^2 - 11^2 - 13^2 + 15^2$$

$$3 = 1^2 - 3^2 + 5^2 + 7^2 + 9^2 + 11^2 + 13^2 - 15^2 - 17^2 - 19^2 + 21^2$$

$$4 = -1^2 - 3^2 - 5^2 - 7^2 + 9^2 - 11^2 - 13^2 + 15^2 - 17^2 + 19^2$$

$$5 = 1^2 + 3^2 + 5^2 + 7^2 + 9^2 + 11^2 + 13^2 + 15^2 - 17^2 - 19^2 - 21^2 - 23^2 - 25^2 + 27^2 + 29^2$$

$$6 = -1^2 - 3^2 + 5^2 - 7^2 - 9^2 + 11^2$$

$$7 = 1^2 + 3^2 + 5^2 + 7^2 + 9^2 + 11^2 + 13^2 + 15^2 + 17^2 - 19^2 + 21^2 - 23^2 - 25^2 - 27^2 + 29^2$$

$$8 = -1^2 + 3^2$$

$$9 = -1^2 - 3^2 + 5^2 - 7^2 - 9^2 - 11^2 - 13^2 - 15^2 - 17^2 + 19^2 - \\ -21^2 - 23^2 - 25^2 - 27^2 + 29^2 + 31^2 + 33^2$$

$$10 = 1^2 + 3^2$$

$$11 = -1^2 - 3^2 + 5^2 - 7^2 - 9^2 - 11^2 - 13^2 - 15^2 + 17^2 - 19^2 - \\ -21^2 + 23^2 + 25^2$$

$$12 = -1^2 - 3^2 - 5^2 - 7^2 + 9^2 + 11^2 - 13^2 + 15^2 + 17^2$$

$$13 = -1^2 - 3^2 - 5^2 - 7^2 + 9^2 + 11^2 - 13^2 - 15^2 + 17^2$$

$$14 = -1^2 - 3^2 - 5^2 + 7^2$$

$$15 = -1^2 - 3^2 + 5^2$$

The above examples of Erdős-Surányi sequences are particular cases of the following result

**Theorem 1.**(M.O. Drimbe, '88, [11]) *Let  $f \in \mathbb{Q}[X]$  be a polynomial such that for any  $n \in \mathbb{Z}$ ,  $f(n)$  is an integer. If the greatest common factor of the terms of the sequence  $\{f(n)\}_{n \geq 1}$  is equal to 1, then  $\{f(n)\}_{n \geq 1}$  is an Erdős-Surányi sequence.*

Using this result, we can obtain other examples of Erdős-Surányi sequences :  $a_n = (an - 1)^k$  for any  $a \geq 2$ , and  $a_n = \binom{n+s}{s}$  for any  $s \geq 2$ . Note that it is difficult to obtain a proof by induction for these sequences, similar to those given for the previous examples.

## 2 Some general results

Recall that a sequence of distinct positive integers is *complete* if every positive integer can be written as a sum of some distinct of its terms. An important result concerning the Erdős-Surányi sequences is the following

**Theorem 2.**(M.O. Drimbe, '83, [10]) *Let  $\{a_m\}_{m \geq 1}$  be a sequence of distinct positive integers such that  $a_1 = 1$  and for every  $n \geq 1$ ,  $a_{n+1} \leq a_1 + \dots + a_n + 1$ . If the sequence contains infinitely many odd integers, then it is a Erdős-Surányi sequence.*

Unfortunately, the sequences mentioned in Section 1 do not satisfy the condition  $a_{n+1} \leq a_1 + \dots + a_n + 1$ ,  $n \geq 1$ , in Theorem 2 so, we cannot use this result to prove they are Erdős-Surányi sequences.



The following integral formula shows the number of representations of an integer for a fixed  $n$ .

**Theorem 3.** (D. Andrica and D. Văcărețu, '06, [4]) *Given a Erdős-Surányi sequence  $\{a_m\}_{m \geq 1}$ , then the number of representations of  $k \in [-u_n, u_n]$ , where  $u_n = a_1 + \dots + a_n$ , in the form  $\pm a_1 \pm a_2 \pm \dots \pm a_n$ , for some choices of signs  $+$  and  $-$ , denoted here by  $A_n(k)$ , is given by*

$$A_n(k) = \frac{2^n}{\pi} \int_0^\pi \cos(kt) \prod_{j=1}^n \cos(a_j t) dt. \quad (1)$$

### 3 The signum equation

For an Erdős-Surányi sequence  $\mathbf{a} = \{a_m\}_{m \geq 1}$ , the *signum equation* of  $\mathbf{a}$  is

$$\pm a_1 \pm a_2 \pm \cdots \pm a_n = 0. \quad (2)$$

For a fixed integer  $n$ , a *solution* to the signum equation is a choice of signs  $+$  and  $-$  such that (2) holds.

Denote by  $S_{\mathbf{a}}(n)$  the number of solutions of the equation (2).

Clearly, if 2 does not divide  $u_n$ , where  $u_n = a_1 + \cdots + a_n$ , then we have  $S_{\mathbf{a}}(n) = 0$ .

Here are few equivalent properties for  $S_{\mathbf{a}}(n)$  (see [3]).

1.  $S_{\mathbf{a}}(n)/2^n$  is the unique real number  $\alpha$  having the property that the function  $f : \mathbb{R} \rightarrow \mathbb{R}$ , defined by

$$f(x) = \begin{cases} \cos \frac{a_1}{x} \cos \frac{a_2}{x} \cdots \cos \frac{a_n}{x} & \text{if } x \neq 0 \\ \alpha & \text{if } x = 0, \end{cases}$$

is a derivative.

2.  $S_{\mathbf{a}}(n)$  is the term not depending on  $z$  in the development of

$$\left(z^{a_1} + \frac{1}{z^{a_1}}\right)\left(z^{a_2} + \frac{1}{z^{a_2}}\right) \cdots \left(z^{a_n} + \frac{1}{z^{a_n}}\right).$$

3.  $S_{\mathbf{a}}(n)$  is the coefficient of  $z^{u_n/2}$  in the polynomial

$$(1 + z^{a_1})(1 + z^{a_2}) \cdots (1 + z^{a_n}).$$

4. The following integral formula holds

$$S_{\mathbf{a}}(n) = \frac{2^{n-1}}{\pi} \int_0^{2\pi} \cos a_1 t \cos a_2 t \cdots \cos a_n t dt. \quad (3)$$

5.  $S_{\mathbf{a}}(n)$  is the number of ordered bipartitions into classes having equal sums of the set  $\{a_1, a_2, \dots, a_n\}$ .

6.  $S_{\mathbf{a}}(n)$  is the number of partitions of  $u_n/2$  into distinct parts, if 2 divides  $u_n$ , and  $S_{\mathbf{a}}(n) = 0$  otherwise.

7.  $S_{\mathbf{a}}(n)$  is the number of distinct subsets of  $\{a_1, a_2, \dots, a_n\}$  whose elements sum to  $u_n/2$  if 2 divides  $u_n$ , and  $S_{\mathbf{a}}(n) = 0$  otherwise.

To study the asymptotic behavior of  $S_{\mathbf{a}}(n)$ , when  $n \rightarrow \infty$ , is a very challenged problem. For instance, for the sequence  $a_n = n^k$ ,  $k \geq 2$ , in this moment we don't have a proof for the relation

$$\lim_{n \rightarrow \infty} \frac{S_k(n)}{2^n n^{-\frac{2k+1}{2}}} = \sqrt{\frac{2(2k+1)}{\pi}},$$

where  $S_k(n)$  stands for  $S_{\mathbf{a}}(n)$  in this case. For  $k = 1$  the previous relation was called the Andrica-Tomescu Conjecture [3], and it was recently proved by B.Sullivan [21].

# The $n$ -range of an Erdős-Surányi sequence

For a fixed  $n \geq 1$ , define the  $n$ -range  $\mathcal{R}_a(n)$  of  $\mathbf{a} = \{a_m\}_{m \geq 1}$  to be the set consisting in all integers

$$\pm a_1 \pm a_2 \pm \cdots \pm a_n. \quad (4)$$

Clearly, for every  $n \geq 1$ , the  $n$ -range  $\mathcal{R}_a(n)$  is a symmetric set with respect 0.

For instance, to determine the range  $\mathcal{R}_1(n)$  for the sequence  $a_m = m$ , was a 2011 Romanian Olympiad problem. Let us include an answer to this problem. The greatest element of the set  $\mathcal{R}_1(n)$  is the triangular number  $T_n := 1 + 2 + \cdots + n = \frac{n(n+1)}{2}$ , and the smallest element of  $\mathcal{R}_1(n)$  is clearly  $-T_n$ . Also, the difference of any two elements of  $\mathcal{R}_1(n)$  is an even number. Hence all elements of  $\mathcal{R}_1(n)$  are of the same parity.

We claim that

$$\mathcal{R}_1(n) = \{-T_n, -T_n + 2, \dots, T_n - 2, T_n\}. \quad (5)$$

Let us define a map on the elements of  $\mathcal{R}_1(n) \setminus \{T_n\}$  having values in  $\mathcal{R}_1(n)$ . First, if  $x \in \mathcal{R}_1(n) \setminus \{T_n\}$  is an element for which the writing begins with  $-1$ , then by changing  $-1$  by  $+1$ , we get  $x + 2 \in \mathcal{R}_1(n)$ . If the writing of  $x$  begins with  $+1$ , then consider the first term in the sum with sign  $-$ . Such a term exists unless  $x = T_n$ . In this case we have

$$x = 1 + 2 + \cdots + (j - 1) - j \pm \cdots \pm n.$$

By changing the signs of terms  $j - 1$  and  $j$ , it follows that  $x + 2 \in \mathcal{R}_1(n)$ . This shows the claim in (5).



For  $k = 2$  the situation with the  $n$ -range  $\mathcal{R}_2(n)$  is almost the same as in case  $k = 1$  but there is an interesting new phenomenon, although expected since  $\{m^2\}_{m \geq 1}$  is a Erdős-Surányi sequence as we have seen. Let us define the set

$$R_2(n) = \left\{ -\sum_2(n), -\sum_2(n) + 2, \dots, \sum_2(n) - 2, \sum_2(n) \right\},$$

where  $\sum_2(n) = 1^2 + 2^2 + \dots + n^2 = \frac{n(n+1)(2n+1)}{6}$ .

**Theorem 3.** (D. Andrica and E.J. Ionaşcu, '13, [2]) For  $n \in \mathbb{N}$ ,  $\mathcal{R}_2(n) = R_2(n) \setminus \mathcal{E}_2(n)$ , where

$$\mathcal{E}_2(n) = \{ \pm(\sum_2(n) - 2j) : j \in E \} \text{ and}$$

$$E := \{2, 3, 6, 7, 8, 11, 12, 15, 18, 19, 22, 23, 24, 27, 28, 31, 32, 33, \\ 43, 44, 47, 48, 60, 67, 72, 76, 92, 96, 108, 112, 128\}.$$

(6)

# The exceptional set of an Erdős-Surányi sequence

For a sequence of distinct positive integers  $\mathbf{a} = \{a_m\}_{m \geq 1}$  define the *exceptional set* of  $\mathbf{a}$  to be the set  $E(\mathbf{a})$  consisting in all positive integers that cannot be represented as a sum of distinct terms of  $\mathbf{a}$ .

The exceptional set of the sequence  $a_m = m^2$  is

$$E := \{2, 3, 6, 7, 8, 11, 12, 15, 18, 19, 22, 23, 24, 27, 28, 31, 32, 33, \\ 43, 44, 47, 48, 60, 67, 72, 76, 92, 96, 108, 112, 128\}.$$

(7)

For  $k = 3$ , a similar result can be stated. The list of the numbers (A001476) which cannot be represented as a sum of distinct cubes has 2788 terms. This was obtained by R. E. Dressler and T. Parker in [9].

For  $k = 4$  the exceptional set of numbers (A046039) has 889576 elements.

In [20], it is denoted by  $P_n(k)$  the number of partitions of  $k$  into distinct parts from  $1, 2^n, 3^n, \dots$ , and it is proved that for each  $n$  there are only a finite number of integers which are not the sums of distinct  $n^{\text{th}}$  powers. That is, there is a positive integer  $N_n$  depending only on  $n$  such that  $P_n(k) > 0$  for all  $k > N_n$ . This result was extended by H. E. Richert ([17]) to a more general class of sequences.

As we have seen for the sequence of squares and of cubes, it is challenging to determine the exceptional set for a given Erdős-Surányi sequence. For a better understanding of the difficulty of this problem, we mention here few more examples.

# Example 1 : Triangular numbers

The sequence  $\mathbf{t}$  of triangular numbers  $T_n = \frac{n(n+1)}{2}$ , ( $n \geq 1$ ), satisfies for every  $m \geq 1$  the relation

$T_{m+3} - T_{m+3} - T_{m+3} + T_m = 2$ . Since we may write  $1 = T_1$  and  $2 = -T_1 + T_2$ , it follows by induction that  $\mathbf{t}$  is an Erdős-Surányi sequence. According to the result of H. E. Richert ([17]), its exceptional set is  $E(\mathbf{t}) = \{2, 5, 8, 12, 23, 33\}$ .

## Example 2 : The sequence of primes

It is also known that the sequence of primes is an Erdős-Surányi sequence. A nice proof based on Theorem 1 combined with Bertrand's postulate is given by M.O. Drimbe ([10], Proposition 4). According to the result of R. E. Dressler [8], every positive integer, except 1, 2 and 6, can be written as the sum of distinct primes, that is the exceptional set of the sequence  $\mathbf{p}$  of primes is  $E(\mathbf{p}) = \{1, 4, 6\}$ .

## Example 3 : Fibonacci numbers

Finally, it is not difficult to check that the hypotheses in Theorem 1 are satisfied for the Fibonacci sequence  $F_0 = 0$ ,  $F_1 = 1$ ,  $F_{n+2} = F_{n+1} + F_n$ ,  $n \geq 0$ . Thus,  $\{F_n\}$  is an Erdős-Surányi sequence. On the other hand, it is more or less known Zeckendorf's theorem in [24], which states that every positive integer can be represented uniquely as the sum of one or more distinct Fibonacci numbers in such a way that the sum does not include two consecutive Fibonacci numbers. Such a sum is called *Zeckendorf representation* and it is related to the Fibonacci coding of a positive integer. In this case, the exceptional set  $E(\mathbf{f})$  of the Fibonacci sequence, say  $\mathbf{f}$ , is the empty set.



## Example 4 : Odd squares

We have seen in the first section that an interesting example of Erdős-Surányi sequence is given by  $a_m = (2m - 1)^2$ , the squares of the odd integers. The exceptional set seems to contain 534 numbers (OEIS, the sequence A167703), but in this moment we don't know a proof for this property

2, 3, 4, 5, 6, 7, 8, 11, 12, 13, 14, 15, 16, 17, 18, 19, 20, 21, 22, 23, 24,  
27, 28, 29, 30, 31, 32, 33, 36, 37, 38, 39, 40, 41, 42, 43, 44, 45, 46, 47, 48,  
51, 52, 53, 54, 55, 56, 57, 60, 61, 62, 63, 64, 65, 66, 67, 68, 69, 70, 71,  
72, 73, 76, 77, 78, 79, 80, 85,  $\dots$ , 1922

**Conjecture 1.** *Every integer  $\geq 1923$  can be written as a sum of distinct odd squares.*

For instance we can write

$$1923 = 11^2 + 29^2 + 31^2, 1924 = 1^2 + 11^2 + 29^2 + 31^2, 1925 = 1^2 + 3^2 + 15^2 + 27^2 + 31^2, 1926 = 1^2 + 3^2 + 11^2 + 15^2 + 27^2 + 29^2$$

**Conjecture 2.** *The exceptional set of every Erdős-Surányi sequence is finite.*

# References I

- [1] Andrica, D., *A combinatorial result concerning the product of two or more derivatives*, Bull. Cal. Math. Soc., **92**(4), 299-304(2000).
- [2] Andrica, D., Ionascu, E.J., *Some unexpected connections between Analysis and Combinatorics*, in "Mathematics without boundaries. Topics in pure Mathematics", Th.M. Rassias and P. Pardalos, Eds., Springer, 2014 (to appear).
- [3] Andrica, D., Tomescu, I., *On an integer sequence related to a product of trigonometric functions, and its combinatorial relevance*, J.Integer Sequence, **5**(2002), Article 02.2.4.
- [4] Andrica, D., Vacaretu, D., *Representation theorems and almost unimodal sequences*, Studia Univ.Babes-Bolyai,Mathematica, Volume **LI**, Number 4, 23-33, 2006.

## References II

- [5] Bateman, P.T., Hildebrand, A.J, Purdy, G.B., *Sums of distinct squares*, Acta Arithmetica, **LXVII.4**(1994), 349-380.
- [6] Brown Jr.,J.L., *Note on complete sequences of integers*, The American Mathematical Monthly, **68**, 6, 557-560(1961).
- [7] Brown Jr.,J.L., *Generalization of Richert's theorem*, The American Mathematical Monthly, **83**, 8, 631-634(1976).
- [8] Dressler, R.E., *A stronger Bertrand's postulate with an application to partitions*, Proc. Amer. Math. Soc., Vol.**33**, No.2, 226-228(1972).
- [9] Dressler, R.E., Parker, T., *12,758*, Mathematics of Computation, Volume **28**, Number 125, January 1974, 313-314.

- [10] Drimbe, M.O., *A problem of representation of integers* (Romanian), G.M.-B, **10-11**(1983), 382-383.
- [11] Drimbe, M.O., *Generalization of representation theorem of Erdős and Surányi*, Annales Societatis Mathematicae Polonae, Series I, Commentationes Mathematicae, XXVII(1988), No.2, 233-235.
- [12] Erdős, P., Surányi, J., *Topics in the Theory of Numbers*, Springer-Verlag, 2003.
- [13] Finch, S. R., *Signum equations and extremal coefficients*, [people.fas.harvard.edu/ sfinch/](http://people.fas.harvard.edu/~sfinch/)
- [14] Grosswald, E., *Representations of Integers as Sums of Squares*, Springer-Verlag, 1985.

- [15] Hwang, H.-K. : Review of "*On an integer sequence related to a product of trigonometric functions, and its combinatorial relevance*", MR1938223.
- [16] Mitek , J., *Generalization of a theorem of Erdős and Surányi*, Annales Societatis Mathematicae Polonae, Series I, Commentationes Mathematicae, XXI(1979).
- [17] Richert, H.E., *Über Zerlegungen in paarweise verschiedene Zahlen*, Nordsk Mat. Tidskr., **31**(1949), 120-122.
- [18] Sierpinski, W., *250 Problems in Elementary Number Theory*, Elsevier, New York/PWN, Warszawa, 1970.
- [19] Sprague, R., *Über Zerlegungen in ungleiche Quadratzahlen*, Math. Z., **51**(1948), 289-290.

- [20] Sprague, R., *Über Zerlegungen in  $n$ -te Potenzen mit lauter verschiedenen Grundzahlen*, Math. Z., **51**(1948), 466-468.
- [21] Sullivan, B.D., *On a Conjecture of Andrica and Tomescu*, J.Integer Sequence 16(2013), Article 13.3.1.
- [22] Tetiva, M., *A representation problem* (Romanian), *Recreații Matematice*, No. 2, 2010, 123-127.
- [23] Tetiva, M., *A representation theorem II* (Romanian), *Recreații Matematice*, No. 1, 2012, 5-10.
- [24] Zeckendorf, E., *Représentation des nombres naturels par une somme de nombres de Fibonacci ou des nombres de Lucas*, Bull. Soc. R. Sci. Liège, **41**, 179-182(1972).
- [25] Wright, E.M., *The representation of a number as a sum of five or more squares*, Quart.J.Math.Oxford Ser.4(1933), 37-51.